

The Honorable John C. Coughenour

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT SEATTLE**

SIXTY-01 ASSOCIATION OF  
APARTMENT OWNERS, a Washington  
non-profit corporation,

Plaintiff,

v.

PUBLIC SERVICE INSURANCE  
COMPANY; GREAT LAKES  
INSURANCE, SE; ASPEN SPECIALTY  
INSURANCE COMPANY; IRONSHORE  
SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY;  
LIBERTY SURPLUS INSURANCE  
COMPANY; ALTERRA EXCESS &  
SURPLUS INSURANCE COMPANY;  
INDIAN HARBOR INSURANCE  
COMPANY; STARR SURPLUS LINES  
INSURANCE COMPANY; HOMELAND  
INSURANCE COMPANY OF NEW  
YORK; CERTAIN UNDERWRITERS AT  
LLOYD'S, LONDON (BRIT SYNDICATE  
2987); and ARCH SPECIALTY  
INSURANCE COMPANY,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 2:22-cv-01373-JCC

**JOINT MODIFIED MODEL  
STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER**

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties

1 acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket  
 2 protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public  
 3 disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential  
 4 treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file  
 5 confidential information under seal.

6 2. CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

7 “Confidential” material shall include the following documents and tangible things  
 8 produced or otherwise exchanged: underwriting materials, guides, handbooks, and other similar  
 9 information constituting the confidential and proprietary business information of Public Service  
 10 Insurance Company (“PSIC”).

11 3. SCOPE

12 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as  
 13 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2) all  
 14 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,  
 15 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

16 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in  
 17 the public domain or which subsequently becomes part of the public domain through means not in  
 18 contravention of this agreement, such as pursuant to an Order of this Court.

19 4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION

20 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material  
 21 that is disclosed or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only  
 22 for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be  
 23 disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement.  
 24 Confidential material must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a  
 25 secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

26 ///

1                   4.2     Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless  
2 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party  
3 may disclose any confidential material only to:

4                   (a)     the receiving party’s counsel of record in this action, as well as  
5 employees of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this  
6 litigation;

7                   (b)     the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel)  
8 of the receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the  
9 parties agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney’s Eyes Only (“AEO”)  
10 and is so designated;

11                  (c)     experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary  
12 for this litigation; counsel who have retained any such expert shall admonish the expert as to their  
13 obligations under this Order;

14                  (d)     the court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

15                  (e)     copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the  
16 duplication of confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or  
17 imaging service instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and  
18 to immediately return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

19                  (f)     during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure  
20 is reasonably necessary, unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the court.  
21 Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential  
22 material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except  
23 as permitted under this agreement;

24                  (g)     the author or recipient of a document containing the information or  
25 a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

1 (h) a party's auditors, regulators, or reinsurers in connection with that  
2 party's regular business practices.

3 4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing  
4 or referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party,  
5 in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will  
6 remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion to  
7 seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the  
8 designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue,  
9 and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to sealing  
10 the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and  
11 the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under  
12 seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must satisfy the  
13 requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion to seal.  
14 Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in accordance with  
15 the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

16 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

17 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each  
18 party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must  
19 take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate  
20 standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material,  
21 documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the  
22 material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
23 unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.

24 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that  
25 are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to  
26  
27

unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this agreement (see, *e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(b) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

(a) Information in documentary form: (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents and deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), the designating party must affix the word "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after receiving the transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the transcript, or exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect confidential information at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

(c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

1           5.3     Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure  
 2 to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party's  
 3 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a  
 4 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated  
 5 in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

6           6.     CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

7           6.1     Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation  
 8 of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality  
 9 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic  
 10 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to  
 11 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the  
 12 original designation is disclosed.

13          6.2     Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any  
 14 dispute regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding  
 15 confidential designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in  
 16 a declaration or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference  
 17 with other affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification  
 18 must list the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires  
 19 a face-to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

20          6.3     Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court  
 21 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Local  
 22 Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of  
 23 persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those  
 24 made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on  
 25 other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain  
 26 the material in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

1           7.     PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN  
2 OTHER LITIGATION

3           If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
4 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that party  
5 must:

6                   (a)     promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the  
7 subpoena or court order;

8                   (b)     promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to  
9 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is  
10 subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

11                   (c)     cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by  
12 the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

13           8.     UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

14           If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential  
15 material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving  
16 party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized disclosures,  
17 (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, and (c) inform  
18 the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this  
19 agreement.

20           9.     INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE  
21 PROTECTED MATERIAL

22           When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently  
23 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
24 receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision  
25 is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or  
26  
27

1 agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the  
2 entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

3 10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS

4 Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving  
5 party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts and  
6 summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of destruction.

7 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all  
8 documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence,  
9 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work  
10 product, even if such materials contain confidential material. Furthermore, nothing herein shall  
11 prohibit a party to this Agreement from maintaining copies of such documents as required to satisfy  
12 their legal, regulatory, or reporting obligations to auditors, regulators, or reinsurers in connection  
13 with that party's regular business practices.

14 The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a  
15 designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

16 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, BY AND THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

17 ///

18 ///

19 ///

20 ///

21 ///

22 ///

23 ///

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///



1 DATED: January 8, 2024

ASHBAUGH BEAL

3 By: s/ Jesse D. Miller

Jesse D. Miller, WSBA #35837

4 jmillers@ashbaughbeal.com

Zachary O. McIsaac, WSBA #35833

5 zmcisaac@ashbaughbeal.com

6 701 Fifth Ave., Ste. 4400

Seattle, WA 98104

7 Attorneys for Sixty-01 Association of  
8 Apartment Owners, a Washington Non-Profit  
9 Corporation

10 DATED: January 8, 2024

McCORMICK, BARSTOW, SHEPPARD,  
11 WAYTE & CARRUTH LLP

12 By: s/ Nicholas H. Rasmussen

Patrick Fredette, WSBA 25300

13 patrick.fredette@mccormickbarstow.com

14 Scripps Center, Suite 1050

312 Walnut Street

15 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Phone (513) 762-7520

16 Fax (513) 762-7521

17 Kevin D. Hansen

18 *Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

Nicholas H. Rasmussen

19 *Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

Maria E. Valencia

20 *Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

McCormick Barstow, LLP

21 7647 N. Fresno Street

22 Fresno, CA 93720

Phone: (559) 433-1300

23 Fax (559) 433-2300

24 Attorneys for Public Service Insurance  
25 Company, an Illinois Corporation

26 ///

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other privilege or protection recognized by law.

DATED this 9th day of January 2024.

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "John C. Coughenour", written over a horizontal line.

John C. Coughenour  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

9583363.1